

CONSTITUTIONAL PROTECTION
OF HUMAN RIGHTS IN LATIN
AMERICA

*A Comparative Study
of the Amparo proceeding*

Allan R. Brewer-Carías

Professor of Law, Central University of Venezuela
Vice-President, International Academy of Comparative Law
Adjunct Professor of Law, Columbia Law School (2006–2007)



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Cambridge, New York, Melbourne, Madrid, Cape Town, Singapore, Sao Paulo, Delhi

Cambridge University Press
32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9780521492027

© Allan R. Brewer-Carías 2008
www.allanbrewercarias.com

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2008

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Brewer Carías, Allan-Randolph.
Constitutional protection of human rights in Latin America: a comparative study of amparo proceedings / Allan R. Brewer-Carías.

p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-521-49202-7 (hardback)

1. Human rights - Latin America. 2. Civil rights - Latin America. 3. Amparo (Writ) - Latin America. I. Title.

KG574.B745 2008

342.808'5-dc22 2008014579

ISBN 978-0-521-49202-7 hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
PART ONE	
THE CONSTITUTIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL DECLARATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND ITS JUDICIAL GUARANTIES	11
Chapter One	
The Constitutional Declaration of Human Rights in Latin America and Its internationalization	13
I. THE SCOPE OF THE CONSTITUTIONAL DECLARATION	13
1. The expansion of the constitutional declaration of rights	16
2. The changes in the obliged party regarding constitutional rights and freedoms	18
3. The declarative nature of the constitutional declaration of rights and the open constitutional clauses	19
4. The absolute or limitative character of the declaration	25
II THE INTERNATIONALIZATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS AND ITS CONSTITUTIONALIZATION	27
1. The American internationalization of human rights	28
2. The constitutionalization of the internationalization of human rights	31
A. The supraconstitutional rank of international instruments of human rights	32
B. The constitutional rank of international instruments of human rights	38
C. The supra-statutory rank of international treaties on human rights	45
D. The statutory rank of international treaties on human rights	50

CONTENTS

3.	The interpretative constitutional rules regarding the international instruments on human rights	54
A.	The interpretation of the Constitution according to the provisions of international instruments	54
B.	The constitutional general references to the universal declarations on human rights	55
C.	The enforcement of rights regardless of their statutory regulation	57
D.	The principle of progressive interpretation of constitutional rights	59
Chapter Two		
Judicial Guaranties of the Declaration of Human Rights		62
I.	THE JUDICIAL GUARANTIES OF CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS	65
II.	THE SPECIFIC JUDICIAL MEANS FOR THE PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS	73
1.	The European amparo actions	73
2.	The Latin American amparo proceeding	77
3.	The writ of amparo in the Philippines	79
PART TWO		
THE AMPARO AS A LATIN AMERICAN CONSTITUTIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL LAW INSTITUTION		81
Chapter Three		
Judicial Review and Amparo Proceeding in Latin America		87
Chapter Four		
The Amparo Action in Countries that Apply Only the Diffuse System of Judicial Review of Legislation		92
Chapter Five		
The Amparo Action in Countries that Apply Only the Concentrated Method of Judicial Review of Legislation		102

CONTENTS

I.	THE AMPARO ACTION IN CONCENTRATED SYSTEMS OF JUDICIAL REVIEW EXERCISED BEFORE ONE SINGLE COURT	102
1.	The recourse for amparo and habeas corpus in Costa Rica	103
2.	The recourse of amparo and of habeas corpus in El Salvador	106
II.	THE AMPARO ACTION IN CONCENTRATED SYSTEMS OF JUDICIAL REVIEW EXERCISED BEFORE A VARIETY OF COURTS	107
1.	The recourse of amparo and habeas corpus in Bolivia	107
2.	The recourse for protection and of habeas corpus in Chile	109
3.	The action of amparo and habeas corpus in Honduras	111
4.	The action of amparo and habeas corpus in Panama	114
5.	The action for amparo, habeas corpus and habeas data in Paraguay	115
6.	The action of amparo and habeas corpus in Uruguay	117
Chapter Six		
The amparo as a Constitutional Right in Countries with Mixed Systems of Judicial Review of Legislation		120
I.	THE AMPARO ACTION IN COUNTRIES WITH MIXED SYSTEMS (DIFFUSE AND CONCENTRATED) OF JUDICIAL REVIEW	120
II.	THE MEXICAN SUIT OF AMPARO	122
III.	THE RIGHT TO AMPARO IN VENEZUELA	129
Chapter Seven		
The Amparo as a Constitutional Guaranty in Countries With Mixed Systems of Judicial Review of Legislation		139
I.	THE AMPARO AS AN EXCLUSIVE COMPETENCE OF ONE SINGLE TRIBUNAL	139
II.	THE ACTION FOR AMPARO EXERCISE BEFORE A VARIETY OF COURTS	142
1.	<i>Mandado de segurança, mandado de injunção,</i> habeas corpus and habeas data in Brazil	142
2.	The action for <i>tutela</i> and habeas corpus in Colombia	147

CONTENTS

3. The action of amparo and habeas corpus in the Dominican Republic	151
4. The action of amparo, habeas corpus and habeas data in Ecuador	153
5. The amparo in Guatemala	155
6. The recourse of amparo, habeas corpus and habeas data in Peru	159
Chapter Eight	
The American Convention on Human Rights and the internationalization of the Amparo in Latin America	163
I. THE INTERNATIONALIZATION OF THE AMPARO PROCEEDING	163
II. THE AMPARO IN THE AMERICAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS	164
III. THE FEATURES OF THE AMPARO AS A RIGHT AND AS JUDICIAL GUARANTY	168
1. The amparo as a human right	168
2. The amparo as a judicial guaranty	169
3. The amparo as a simple, prompt and effective judicial guaranty	170
IV. THE RIGHTS TO BE PROTECTED BY THE AMERICAN CONVENTION AMPARO	171
1. The amparo as a judicial guaranty for the protection of everyone's rights and guaranties	171
2. The amparo as a judicial guaranty for the protection of all constitutional rights and guaranties	173
V. THE UNIVERSAL CHARACTER OF THE PROTECTION IN THE AMERICAN CONVENTION AMPARO	174
1. The amparo as a judicial guaranty for the protection of all constitutional rights and guaranties, against any violation or harm from the State or individuals	174
2. The amparo as a judicial guaranty that can be filed at any time, including in situations of emergency	176

PART THREE

THE INJURED PARTY AND THE CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS PROTECTED BY MEANS OF THE AMPARO PROCEEDING 179

Chapter Nine

The Injured Party: The Plaintiff and the Rules of Standing 181

I. THE INJURED PERSONS AND THE QUESTION OF STANDING 182

1. Natural persons: Standing *ad causam* and *ad processum* 184

2. Artificial persons: Standing *ad causam* and *ad processum* 188

3. Standing and the protection of collective and diffuse constitutional rights 193

II. PUBLIC OFFICIALS WITH STANDING IN THE AMPARO PROCEEDING 202

1. The People's Defendant's standing to file amparo actions 202

2. The question of the standing of other public officers in the amparo suit 206

III. THE INJURED THIRD PARTY FOR THE PLAINTIFF 209

Chapter Ten

The Justiciable Constitutional Rights by Means of the Amparo and Habeas Corpus Actions 212

I. CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS AND JUSTICIABILITY 212

II. AMPARO FOR THE JUSTICIABILITY OF CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS ONLY IN CASES OF CONSTITUTIONAL VIOLATIONS 215

III. AMPARO AND HABEAS CORPUS FOR THE PROTECTION OF ALL CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS 218

IV. AMPARO AND HABEAS CORPUS FOR THE PROTECTION OF ONLY SOME CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS 223

1. The European restrictive scope of the amparo 224

2. The Chilean *acción de protección* for determined rights 228

CONTENTS

3.	The Colombian <i>acción de tutela</i> for the protection of fundamental rights	228
4.	The Mexican amparo for the protection of the “individual guaranties”	231
5.	The writ of amparo in the Philippines for the protection of the right to life, liberty and safety	233
V.	THE QUESTION OF THE PROTECTION OF RIGHTS IN SITUATIONS OF EMERGENCY	234
	Chapter Eleven	
	The Question of the Justiciability of Social Constitutional Rights by Means of the Amparo Action	240
I.	THE QUESTION OF THE JUSTICIABILITY OF SOCIAL RIGHTS	240
II.	THE CASE OF THE RIGHT TO HEALTH AND THE STATE OBLIGATIONS	242
III.	THE JUSTICIABILITY OF THE RIGHT TO HEALTH	247
1.	The protection to the right to health as a collective right	248
2.	The protection to the right to health in connection to the right to life and the social security obligations	249
3.	The limited protection of the right to health and the State’s financial resources	255
4.	The rejection of the amparo protection when argued in an abstract way	256
	PART FOUR:	
	THE INJURY, THE INJURING PARTY AND THE INJURING ACTS OR OMISSIONS IN THE AMPARO PROCEEDING	259
	Chapter Twelve	
	The General Conditions of the Injury (Harms and Threats)	261
I.	THE PERSONAL AND DIRECT CHARACTER OF THE INJURY	261
II.	THE ACTUAL AND REAL CHARACTER OF THE INJURY	262
III.	THE MANIFESTLY ARBITRARY, ILLEGAL AND ILLEGITIMATE INJURY	267

CONTENTS

IV. THE EVIDENT CHARACTER OF THE INJURY	268
V. THE NON-CONSENTED CHARACTER OF THE INJURY	269
1. The express consent	270
2. The tacit consent	270
3. Exceptions to the tacit consent rule	272
Chapter Thirteen	
The Reparable Character of the Harms and the Restorative Character of the Amparo Proceeding	276
I. THE RESTORATIVE CHARACTER OF THE AMPARO AGAINST HARMS	276
II. THE SPECIFIC CONDITION OF THE HARM: ITS REPARABLE CHARACTER	277
Chapter Fourteen	
The Imminent Character of the Threats and the Preventive Character of the Amparo Proceeding	283
I. THE PREVENTIVE CHARACTER OF THE AMPARO AGAINST THREATS	283
II. THE SPECIFIC CONDITION OF THE THREAT: ITS IMMINENT CHARACTER	284
Chapter Fifteen	
The Injuring Party: The Defendant (Public Entities or Private Individuals)	289
I. THE INJURING PARTY	289
1. The question of the individuation of the defendant	290
2. The defendant in the amparo suit: authorities and individuals	295
A. The amparo against public authorities: public entities and public officers	296
B. The amparo against individuals or private persons	299
II. THE PARTICIPATION OF THIRD PARTIES FOR THE DEFENDANT IN THE AMPARO PROCEEDING	303

CONTENTS

Chapter Sixteen

The Injuring Public Actions and Omissions of Public Authorities Causing the Harms or the Threats

	305
I. AMPARO AGAINST LEGISLATIVE ACTIONS	307
1. Amparo against parliamentary bodies' and their commissions' decisions	307
2. Amparo against laws (statutes)	308
II. AMPARO AGAINST EXECUTIVE AND ADMINISTRATIVE ACTS AND ACTIONS	314
1. Amparo and executive acts	314
2. Amparo and the political questions	317
3. Amparo proceeding and the functioning of public services	318
III. AMPARO AGAINST JUDICIAL ACTS AND DECISIONS	320
1. The admission of amparo actions against judicial decisions	320
2. The exclusion of the amparo actions against judicial decisions	323
IV. AMPARO AGAINST ACTS OF OTHER CONSTITUTIONAL ENTITIES AND AGAINST PUBLIC OMISSIONS	324
1. Acts of other constitutional entities	324
2. Public entities omissions	325

PART FIVE:

THE EXTRAORDINARY CHARACTER OF THE AMPARO PROCEEDING

329

Chapter Seventeen

The Question of the Admissibility of the Amparo and Its Relation with the Ordinary Judicial Means

331

I. THE CONDITION OF THE NON-AVAILABILITY OF OTHER ADEQUATE JUDICIAL OR ADMINISTRATIVE MEANS FOR THE PROTECTION OF CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS	332
II. THE CONDITION OF THE PREVIOUS EXHAUSTION OF THE ORDINARY JUDICIAL MEANS	338
III. THE QUESTION DERIVED FROM THE PREVIOUS FILING OF OTHER REMEDIES THAT ARE PENDING DECISION, INCLUDING AMPARO SUITS	342

Chapter Eighteen	
The Main Principles of the Procedure in the Amparo Proceeding	346
I. THE BILATERAL CHARACTER OF THE PROCEDURE	346
II. THE BRIEF AND PROMPT CHARACTER OF THE PROCESS	349
III. THE PREFERRED CHARACTER OF THE PROCEDURE AND THE ROLE OF THE COURTS	351
IV. THE ACTIVE ROLE OF THE COURTS	353
V. THE PREVALENCE OF SUBSTANTIVE LAW	353
Chapter Nineteen	
The Configuration of the Main Phases of the Amparo Proceeding	354
I. GENERAL PROVISIONS REGARDING THE FILING OF THE PETITION	354
II. THE DECISION REGARDING THE ADMISSIBILITY OF THE PETITION	357
III. GENERAL PRINCIPLES REGARDING EVIDENCE AND BURDEN TO PROVE	358
IV. THE DEFENDANT'S (THE INJURER OR AGGRIEVING PARTY) PLEADING OR ANSWER	360
V. THE PUBLIC HEARING IN THE AMPARO SUIT	362
Chapter Twenty	
The Adjudication in the Amparo Proceeding and the Preliminary Protective Measures	364
I. THE PRELIMINARY AMPARO MEASURES	366
II. THE SUSPENSION OF THE EFFECTS OF THE CHALLENGED ACT AND OTHER PRELIMINARY MEASURES	368
III. THE CONDITIONS FOR THE ISSUING OF PRELIMINARY PROTECTIVE MEASURES	373
IV. THE <i>INAUDITA PARS</i> ISSUING OF THE PRELIMINARY PROTECTIVE MEASURES	374
V. THE MODIFIABILITY OF THE PRELIMINARY MEASURES	375

CONTENTS

Chapter Twenty-One

The Definitive Judicial Adjudication in the Amparo Suit	377
I. THE GENERAL CONDITIONS OF THE DECISION	377
II. THE PREVENTIVE AND RESTORATIVE NATURE OF THE AMPARO	380
III. THE QUESTION OF THE ANNULLING CONTENT OF THE AMPARO	382
IV. THE NON-COMPENSATORY CHARACTER OF THE AMPARO DECISION	384
V. THE PAYMENT OF THE COSTS OF THE PROCEDURE	387
VI. THE EFFECTS OF THE DEFINITIVE JUDICIAL DECISION ON THE AMPARO SUIT	387
1. The <i>inter partes</i> effects and its exceptions	387
2. The question of the scope of the <i>res judicata</i> effects	390
VII. THE OBLIGATORY CHARACTER OF THE AMPARO RULINGS AND THE SANCTION FOR CONTEMPT POWER	394

Chapter Twenty-Two

The Revision of the Amparo Decisions by the Constitutional Court or the Supreme Court	397
I. THE EXTRAORDINARY RECOURSE IN ARGENTINA AND THE MANDATORY JURISDICTION OF THE SUPREME COURT	400
II. THE CONSTITUTIONAL JURISDICTION REVIEW POWERS IN COUNTRIES HAVING ONLY A CONCENTRATED METHOD OF JUDICIAL REVIEW	401
1. The exclusive power of the Constitutional Chambers of the Supreme Courts in Costa Rica and El Salvador in constitutional matters	402
2. The Constitutional Jurisdiction Courts review powers in constitutional matters in Bolivia and Honduras	403
A. The automatic and mandatory review jurisdiction of the Constitutional Tribunal in Bolivia	403
B. The appellate and discretionary review jurisdiction of the Constitutional Chamber in Honduras	404

CONTENTS

III. THE CONSTITUTIONAL JURISDICTION REVIEW POWERS IN COUNTRIES HAVING A MIXED SYSTEM OF JUDICIAL REVIEW	404
1. The Supreme Court of Nicaragua and its review powers in matters judicial review through the cassation recourse	405
2. The constitutional jurisdiction review powers on constitutional matters in Brazil, Colombia, Ecuador, Guatemala, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela	406
A. The automatic review jurisdiction of the Constitutional Tribunals in Ecuador and Colombia	406
a. The mandatory revision in matters of amparo and the obligatory constitutional report in matters of judicial review in Ecuador	406
b. The discretionary review jurisdiction of the <i>tutela</i> decisions in Colombia	407
B. The appellate review jurisdiction of the constitutional jurisdictions in Brazil, Guatemala, Mexico, Peru and Venezuela	409
a. The mandatory jurisdiction of the Constitutional Jurisdictions in Brazil, Guatemala and Peru	409
b. The discretionary jurisdiction of the constitutional jurisdictions in Mexico and Venezuela	411
3. The <i>ex officio</i> review jurisdiction of the constitutional jurisdictions in constitutional matters	413
CONCLUSION	417
APPENDIX A: <i>List of Latin American Constitutions</i>	423
APPENDIX B: <i>List of Latin American Amparo Laws (Statutes)</i>	425
INDEX	427